

2020

Tucson-Pima County Historical Commission
Plans Review Subcommittee

MINUTES

Thursday, January 23, 2020

**2nd Floor Conference Room, City of Tucson Department of
Transportation, Transit Services, 149 N. Stone, Tucson, Arizona
85701.**

1. Call to Order and Roll Call

Meeting called to order at 1:05 P.M., and a quorum was established.

Commissioners Present: Terry Majewski (Chair), Jim Sauer, Helen Erickson, and Jan Mulder.

Commissioners Absent/Excused: Jill Jenkins, Sharon Chadwick, and Michael Becherer.

Staff Members Present: Michael Taku, Jodie Brown, and Nick Ross (PDSD).

2. Approval of the Legal Action Report (LAR) from Meeting(s) of 1-09-20

It was moved by Commissioner Sauer, duly seconded by Commissioner Mulder, and carried by a voice vote of 4-0 to approve the Legal Action Report from the meeting of 1-09-20 and amended with a correction to the vote on item #4 to be 4-0 not 5-0.

3. Historic Preservation Zone Review Cases

UDC Section 5.8/TSM 9-02.0.0/Historic District Design Guidelines/Revised Secretary of the Interior's Standards and Guidelines

HPZ 19-37, 508 W 18th Street

Barrio Historico Historic Preservation Zone, Contributing Resource

Revisions to the approved plans, including modifications to the roof line.

Staff Taku summarized the project and read into the record the request from PRS meeting of 1-09-20 as follows: specifically addressing (1) the north and east elevations of the porch to clearly represent applicant's

intent; (2) show proposed configuration of roof in section "A" on sheet 4; (3) show proposed drainage of water as recommended by BHHZAB.

Troy Williams, designer for the applicant Mike Sergovia, presented revised plans based on feedback from the 1-09-20, meeting. The designer presented revision #4 dated 1-16-20 as a response to PRS request.

Discussion was held. Subcommittee discussion focused on penetrations on existing wall; parapets, roof types (new shed roof), clarity on elevations, detail sections and water drainage paths. Drawings on Section "A" on sheet 4, and the East and North elevations on sheet 5 require revisions. Action was taken.

It was moved by Commissioner Erickson, duly seconded by Commissioner Mulder, and passed by a voice vote of 3-1 (Commissioner Sauer dissent) to recommend approval as presented, noting the following drawings that require corrections: "Section A" on sheet 4, and "East Elevation" and "North Elevation" on page 5.

HPZ 19-98, 811-821 South 4th Avenue

Armory Park Historic Preservation Zone, Contributing & Non-Contributing Resource

New Minor Subdivision: Flexible lot development for the construction of four (4) new buildings, five (5) residences

Note: The HPZ-19-98; 99 and 100 were reviewed together, but separate motions were made regarding each case.

Staff Taku summarized the project and provided copies for the record of the recommendations from the APHZAB meetings of 11-19-19 and 12-17-19 to the subcommittee.

Architect Bill Mackey, from Worker, Inc. presented an overview of the proposed redevelopment project that would combine three current parcels with two contributing structures into a new FLD project. There will be seven (7) new lots and four (4) new buildings built on the site.

Discussion was held. Subcommittee discussion focused on height; roof types, fencing, lack of clarity on buildings on the lots, and concerns expressed on the Railroad Avenue façade. Action was taken.

It was moved by Commissioner Sauer, duly seconded by Commissioner Erickson, and passed by a voice vote of 4-0 to recommend to continue the case, to allow the applicant to return with additional information, in particular: (1) to provide documentation of heights of contributing

properties with similar roof types; (2) to provide more details on the proposed mesquite fencing; (3) to provide a site plan to better identify location of proposed buildings in relationship to existing lot lines; (4) to encourage the applicant to work with city staff to provide additional clarity on agenda item descriptions; and (5) to provide any further documentation to help with concerns expressed regarding the Railroad Avenue façades.

HPZ 19-99, 811-821 South 4th Avenue

Armory Park Historic Preservation Zone, Non-Contributing Resource

New Minor Subdivision: Flexible lot development for the construction of four (4) new residences.

Staff Taku summarized the project and provided copies for the record of the recommendations from the APHZAB meetings of 11-19-19 and 12-17-19 to the subcommittee.

Architect Bill Mackey, from Worker, Inc. presented the project.

Discussion was held. Action was taken.

It was moved by Commissioner Sauer, duly seconded by Commissioner Erickson, and passed by a voice vote of 4-0 to recommend to continue the case, to allow the applicant to return with additional information, in particular: (1) to provide documentation of heights of contributing properties with similar roof types; (2) to provide more details on the proposed mesquite fencing; (3) to provide a site plan to better identify location of proposed buildings in relationship to existing lot lines; (4) to encourage the applicant to work with city staff to provide additional clarity on agenda item descriptions; and (5) to provide any further documentation to help with concerns expressed regarding the Railroad Avenue façades.

HPZ 19-100, 811-821 S. 4th Avenue

Armory Park Historic Preservation Zone, Non-Contributing Resource

New Minor Subdivision: Flexible lot development for the construction of four (4) new residences.

Staff Taku summarized the project and provided copies for the record of the recommendations from the APHZAB meetings of 11-19-19 and 12-17-19 to the subcommittee.

Project architect, Bill Mackey, from Worker, Inc. presented the project.

Discussion was held. Action was taken.

It was moved by Commissioner Sauer, duly seconded by Commissioner Erickson, and passed by a voice vote of 4-0 to recommend to continue the case, to allow the applicant to return with additional information, in

particular: (1) to provide documentation of heights of contributing properties with similar roof types; (2) to provide more details on the proposed mesquite fencing; (3) to provide a site plan to better identify location of proposed buildings in relationship to existing lot lines; (4) to encourage the applicant to work with city staff to provide additional clarity on agenda item descriptions; and (5) to provide any further documentation to help with concerns expressed regarding the Railroad Avenue façades.

**HPZ 20-007, 5 Points Transportation Enhancement Art Project
Adjacent to Armory Park Historic Historic Presevation Zone.**

Construct decorative arches over the roadway (intersection of South Stone, South 6th Avenue and West 18th Street) in the Right-Of-Way.

Staff Taku introduced the project and read into the record the recommendation from the APHZAB meeting of 1-21-19.

Project Manager Jesse Soto from the Tucson Department of Transportation (TDOT) presented the project.

Discussion was held. Subcommittee expressed concerns on the location of the César Chavez statue, adjacency to historic resources and failure to follow a legally mandated review process. Action was taken.

It was moved by Commissioner Sauer, and duly seconded by Commissioner Erickson, and passed by a voice vote of 4-0 to recommend against approval of the proposed project as presented for the following reasons: (1) inconsistencies within the drawing set, particularly regarding the location of the proposed statue; (2) concerns about adjacencies with historic resources; (3) concerns with the placement of the César Chavez statue, wedged between a traffic signal and a historic sign with the text "Ugly But Honest"; and (4) the potential confusion raised by what could appear to be a street sign announcing " César Chavez Avenue." In addition, we would like to express our concerns with the review process as it happened in this case.

**Stone Minor Subdivision, 601 S Stone Avenue
Armory Park Historic Residential District, Downtown Infill Incentive District.
Multi-Family Residences.
[Courtesy Review]**

Not reviewed. No action taken.

**Tucson Convention Center, 260 S Church Avenue
Rio Nuevo Downtown Core, Downtown Infill Incentive District
Construction of a new garage
[Courtesy Review]**

Not reviewed. No action taken.

4. Rio Nuevo Area (RNA)/Infill Incentive District (IID) Review Cases

UDC Sections 5.12.7; 5.12.6.E.2; 5.12.7 & 5.12.10

**IID-19-10/HPZ 20-009, 902/912 S 6th Avenue
Greater Infill Incentive District**

The Flash TV South Project: Lot combination and construction of three (3)-story, 33-unit apartment building. The building includes one-bedroom units with 35-space screened parking lot on the southern half of the site.

Staff Taku and Ross introduced the project. Staff provided the subcommittee a copy of the Design Professional comments.

Architect Bob Lanning, Lanning Architecture presented the project.

Discussion was held. Action was taken.

It was moved by Commissioner Sauer, duly seconded by Commissioner Mulder, and carried by a voice vote of 4-0 to recommend to continue the case, to allow the applicant to return with alternatives to activate the façade on 6th Avenue, ideally a nonresidential activation of that façade.

5. Current Issues for Information/Discussion

a. Minor Reviews

Staff provided an update on reviews conducted in Armory Park and West University.

b. Appeals

None at this time.

c. Zoning Violations

Staff provided information on ongoing and pending cases being worked on for compliance. Specifically, 541 S Main Avenue (revision to plans) and 1717 E 8th Street (unpermitted additions).

d. Review Process Issues/Discussions

Subcommittee request staff clarification on relationship between PAD and Historic Review process.

6. **Call to the Audience (Information Only)**

John Burr mentioned Mayor and Council hearing on 375 S Stone Avenue scheduled for 1/28/20. Martha McClements stated that APHZAB will review the Baffert proposed 3-Story Building on 2/4/20.

7. **Schedule and Future Items for Upcoming Meetings**

Staff provided information on upcoming items for PRS. Next PRS meeting is scheduled for 2-13-20.

8. **Adjournment**

Meeting adjourned at 3:28 P.M.